

Amended  
Exhibit "A"  
2022-R43

## CITY OF GREEN



CONSULTANTS TO MANAGEMENT

---

# Compensation Study

June 16, 2022

Submitted by:

Kevin Shebesta  
Account Manager

Clemans, Nelson & Associates, Inc.  
2351 S. Arlington Rd., Ste A  
Akron OH 44319-1907

Akron | Cincinnati | Columbus | Lima  
1 800.282.0787

[www.clemansnelson.com](http://www.clemansnelson.com)

"A" Jididix3



June 16, 2022

Pamela Serina  
Human Resources Manager  
City of Green  
1755 Town Park Boulevard  
P. O. Box 278  
Green OH 44232-0278

**RE: Compensation Study Proposal**

Dear Ms. Serina:

We have enclosed a proposal to provide services for a Job Analysis and Compensation Study, in response to your request. We have provided details on our methodology and process and cost estimate for completion of the project. This is a firm offer for a 90-day period from the opening date.

I will serve as project manager for this engagement should we be selected. Please feel free to contact me at 614.923.7700 (or 1.800.282.0787); you may also reach me via e-mail at [kshebesta@clemansnelson.com](mailto:kshebesta@clemansnelson.com). My bio, as well as those of other project team and key staff members, are included in the proposal; we will utilize everyone as necessary throughout the course of the project.

Thank you for allowing us to propose our services.

Yours very truly,

CLEMANS, NELSON & ASSOCIATES, INC.

*/s/ Kevin Shebesta*

Kevin Shebesta  
Account Manager

Enclosure(s)

Clemans, Nelson & Associates, Inc.  
Akron | Cincinnati | Columbus | Lima  
1.800.282.0787  
[www.clemansnelson.com](http://www.clemansnelson.com)

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

Statement of Understanding and Project Methodology and Process.....	1
Experience and Background .....	7
Staffing.....	8
References.....	10

## STATEMENT OF UNDERSTANDING

Clemans Nelson has completed approximately 55-65 Compensation Study Projects for public sector clients in the past five (5) years alone. As a result, our staff is well-versed in compensation plan design and administration, the latest survey techniques, and statistical analysis and application. We are committed to serving each of our clients with excellence, and we are confident that Clemans Nelson is one of the top human resources consulting firms in the state of Ohio.

Our Compensation Study clients include cities throughout the state of Ohio, counties, townships, and villages, as well as metropolitan housing authorities, job and family services, auditors, etc. Please see our REFERENCES section for a representative sampling of clients for whom we have performed work in the past three (3) years.

## PROJECT METHODOLOGY AND PROCESS

### Classification and Compensation Study

#### STEP ONE — Review of Client Documents

- Consultant will review current wage/salary schedules, compensation and benefit policies and practices, and other similar, relevant documents.
- Consultant will be able to formulate a preliminary understanding of the current system and needs based on the data and the Consultant's experience and expertise.

#### STEP TWO — Initial Client Meeting(s)

- Kickoff meeting
  - Discuss development of the current compensation system to ensure an understanding of the scope of the project.
  - Discussion will center on identifying needs, issues, and problems; obtaining reactions to existing programs and determining management's views on compensation philosophy and objectives.
  - Consultant will incorporate the client's strategic suggestions into the proposed project methodology and confirm any modifications in the scope of the project or methodology with the client before proceeding.
  - Tentative timeline and time commitments from the client will be established.

- Secondary meeting(s)
  - Review how the point factor evaluation will be conducted, determine the factors to be included in the point factoring process, and the weight or worth to be assigned to each factor and factor level.
  - Meeting(s) will also be used to determine benchmark positions to be surveyed externally, as well as which jurisdictions.
    - Benchmark positions – generally a cross-section of non-overlapping positions, spanning most pay grades; Consultant will rely upon client input during discussions, including any position(s) for which client has experienced higher than normal turnover, difficulties in recruitment, issues relative to assigned pay grade, etc.
    - Regional Entities – Consultant will put together a demographic profile of regional labor markets, paying particular attention to immediately adjacent relevant entities; demographics will include information such as population, median wage, income tax collections and rate.
  - Additionally, Consultant will meet with key staff as needed to determine what factors are to be assigned and confirm the positions to be surveyed.

### STEP THREE — Job Analysis and Position Description Update

- Consultant will gather and review current position descriptions.
- Consultant will distribute customized Position Analysis Questionnaires (PAQs), and if necessary, conduct interviews with subject matter experts to determine what tasks are performed.
  - PAQs are a valuable tool in a job analysis and compensation study as they enable the consultant to gain valuable insight into distinctions within jobs with the same title that may be department and/or position specific.

FOR ALL NON-BARGAINING  
EMPLOYEES (UPTO 37) - NOT TO  
INCLUDE  
SEASONAL  
POSITIONS.  
LCD

Any changes in classification, working titles, and minimum qualifications, based on job analysis, will be noted.

- Consultant will update current position descriptions.

\*\*\* See quote below for cost without position description updates\*\*\*

### STEP FOUR — Conducting the Wage Survey

- Consultant will develop an electronic survey instrument to query on both compensation and benefit structures, and distribute based on discussions with client.
- Compile survey results, analyze labor market trends, and prepare recommendations to the client for pay and/or benefit adjustments for the selected benchmark positions.



- Other wage and benefit data information available from the client may also be utilized.
- This step measures job worth from an external standpoint; proper external equity allows an employer to recruit and retain quality employees.

## STEP FIVE — Internal Equity Analysis

- This step measures job worth from an internal standpoint, which facilitates proper pay grade assignment; it also helps provide a defensible position for any appeals and/or audits.
- Consultant will work with client to develop a point factor evaluation instrument and scoring system.
- Consultant will evaluate all positions/classifications for point factoring purposes, analyzing the compensable factors, and assigning points based on those factors. A spreadsheet will be created, and a meeting will be held with the client to review results and potential impact on current pay grade assignments based on Consultant's recommendations.
- Consultant will ensure internal pay equity is consistent with job classification.
- The Consultant will review the compensation plan and analyze for wage compression issues.

## STEP SIX — Developing Compensation Plan & Pay Schedule

- Consultant will prepare a written compensation philosophy and pay procedures to establish and/or modify:
  - Existing compensation system(s);
  - Ongoing administration of the compensation plan; and
  - Appeal processes (job audit).
- Proper maintenance will ensure the integrity of the plan.
- Consultant will make modifications to the compensation plan structure based on a combination of:
  - Survey results
  - Client input
  - Fluctuation in relevant indices (CPI, ECI, SSI)
- Consultant will prepare a statistical database outlining any changes to be made to existing pay grades and/or wage ranges.

- Next, the Consultant will review the assignment of positions to appropriate pay grades, analyze for any pay compression issues, and make revisions if necessary, and will also determine preliminary cost estimates for plan installation.
- Finally, the Consultant will review the feasibility of implementing the plan and address any additional client concerns.

## STEP SEVEN — Meeting with Client to Review Pay Plan

---

- Consultant will meet with staff to present project deliverables, including the pay schedule, pay grade assignments, implementation cost estimates, and compensation philosophy and procedures.
- Consultant will solicit any final input for revisions as necessary.

## STEP EIGHT — Finalize Compensation Plan

---

- Consultant will finalize the compensation plan as requested by the client within professionally accepted standards and will present the completed plan to the client.

## PROJECT TIMEFRAME

3 – 4 months

We have established our project timeframe based on the specifications outlined within the Request for Proposal. Wage surveys, in particular, can be a time-consuming process. We utilize an electronic survey instrument to increase survey response rates and to help decrease the need for follow-up, as well as enabling thorough, comprehensive data analysis.

In addition, we build in the timeframes necessary to allow for multiple meetings with key management staff, and to allow for proper review and consideration throughout the entire compensation study process.

## OUR BILLING RATES

All work outlined within the Project Scope will be billed at our Retainer Rates throughout the Project Lifecycle as a courtesy. If additional work is requested by the Client that falls outside of the Project Scope outlined herein, Consultant will provide billing rate options prior to the commencement of the additional work.

<i>Consultant / Analyst .....</i>	<i>\$140/hour</i>
<i>Senior Consultant .....</i>	<i>\$155/hour</i>
<i>Manager .....</i>	<i>\$170/hour</i>
<i>Director / Vice President / President.....</i>	<i>\$185/hour</i>

### NON-RETAINER CLIENTS

Non-retainer rates are \$15 per hour higher than those for Retainer clients.

*All work is performed by Clemans Nelson employees and will not be subcontracted out.*





COST OF PROPOSED PROJECT:  
COMPENSATION STUDY

CITY OF GREEN

Estimated Consultant Time Cost

Project with Position Description Updates – Retainer Client

<input type="checkbox"/> Professional Services	Not to Exceed	\$15,470- \$18,600
--	---------------	--------------------

Project without Position Description Updates – Retainer Client

<input type="checkbox"/> Professional Services	Not to Exceed	\$12,137 - \$15,245
--	---------------	---------------------

Mileage, Reasonable and Necessary Expenses	\$200
--	-------

\*If project is done without retainer, the above maximum not to exceed will be increased by \$1,000\*\*\*

AUTHORIZATION

I hereby authorize Clemans, Nelson & Associates, Inc. to proceed with the above project in accordance with the letter submitted and agree to pay all costs as contained herein.

\_\_\_\_\_  
Authorizing Signature

\_\_\_\_\_  
Date



## EXPERIENCE AND BACKGROUND

### **Organization History and Statement of Demonstrated Effectiveness**

No other organization in Ohio can match Clemans Nelson's experience and ability to provide all of the services involved in conducting a compensation study. Clemans Nelson is a professional management consulting firm that has been in business for over 40 years. We exclusively represent employers. Ninety-five percent (95%) of Clemans Nelson's clients are public employers, including cities, counties, housing authorities, health districts, townships, and villages. As a highly reputable consulting firm, Clemans Nelson provides employers with timely, substantial, objective, and state-of-the-art expertise regarding all aspects of labor relations and personnel administration.

We are 100% employee owned and all of our staff and officers are directly involved in client service. We currently have over 23 professionals on staff, with experience and degrees in human resource management, public administration, business, law, and other professions. Clemans Nelson itself is a management consulting firm and does not practice law.

Clemans Nelson's staff is fully-qualified to provide any of the following management consulting services:

- Classification and Compensation
- Operational and Organizational Analysis
- Personnel Systems Analysis
- Employee Relations Audits
- Labor Negotiations and Labor Arbitrations
- SERB Representation
- Guidance regarding compliance with Civil Service, FLSA, EEOC, UC, COBRA, FMLA, ADA, other employment-related regulations
- Personnel Policy Manuals, Employee Handbooks, Performance Evaluation Systems, Compensation Plans, Classification Plans/Position Descriptions
- Leadership and Supervisory Training

Clemans Nelson's staff has more combined experience working with public sector employers than any other firm in Ohio. The knowledge and experience of our staff will allow us to provide the requested services in the most cost-effective and efficient manner possible.

## STAFFING

### Project Team Qualifications of Staff / Resumes



**Robin Bell** serves as Regional Manager for our Akron office, and is a member of Clemans Nelson's Board of Directors as well as serving as Director of Human Resources. Like all Clemans Nelson managers, she remains intricately involved in working with clients on various employment and human resource

issues. She represents clients at labor negotiations and arbitration proceedings, and counsels clients on dealing with complex issues arising in the context of discipline, regulatory compliance, and allegations of discrimination. Robin also works with clients to develop and manage personnel systems components, (i.e., position descriptions, classification plans, personnel policies, etc.) so as to mitigate liability and provide a sound basis for the employment actions that our clients take. A sought after speaker, Robin regularly conducts supervisory training on discriminatory harassment and contract administration for clients. She has lectured on selected public sector personnel and labor relations topics for the Labor Arbitration Institute, the Kent State School of Public Policy & Public Administration, and other statewide associations. Robin received her B.A. from Ohio University and her Juris Doctor from the University of Akron School of Law. Robin joined Clemans Nelson in 1999 after serving as General Counsel for one of the largest Sheriff's Office in the State of Ohio. Prior to that, she was in private practice as a labor attorney in the State of California. As General Counsel, she was responsible for evaluating legal compliance in a highly regulated environment, and intricately involved in aspects of labor relations and human resources.



**Heidi L. Miller** joined Clemans Nelson in 2014 and is a Senior Consultant, working with clients on a variety of employment and human resource management issues, compensation plans, and wage surveys. Heidi has served as Project Manager or Co-Project Manager for numerous compensation study engagements, working closely with clients such as Portage County BOC, MORPC, Franklin County Auditor, Village of Archbold, and the City of



**Michael D. Esposito** is a Vice President and serves as Director of Client Development, and works out of our Akron office. Michael received his B.A. from Miami University (OH), and his J.D. from Cleveland-Marshall College of Law. He is experienced in all aspects of personnel systems development,

regulatory compliance, human resource management, and collective bargaining. With more than 200 sets of negotiations to his credit, his practice primarily consists of representing municipal, township, and county clients in complex labor negotiations and dispute resolution proceedings. His experience bargaining and guiding managers in some of the most labor friendly environments in the state of Ohio has made him particularly adept at achieving client objectives for dynamic change, while maintaining the critical relationships between the parties so they can function effectively after negotiations have concluded.

Away from the bargaining table, Mike regularly advises clients on matters involving general Ohio Civil Service, sensitive disciplinary matters, FMLA, FLSA, ADA, internal investigations, and other employment-related issues; provides representation in arbitrations and administrative appeals; and conducts management and supervisory development training on various public sector employment issues. A sought after speaker, Mike has lectured on selected public sector personnel and labor relations topics for the State of Ohio Auditor's Office, OHPELRA, NPELRA, CCAO, OCMA, OML, Mayor's Association of Ohio, Ohio Public Safety Director's Association, Kent State School of Public Policy & Public Administration, and other statewide associations.



**Kevin J. Shebesta** is a Senior Consultant with Clemans Nelson. He joined Clemans Nelson in 2012 with over seven years of general litigation and private employment law experience, as well as experience with private labor law matters. While in private practice, Kevin's work included counseling employers with regard to employee personnel issues and dealing with employment discrimination, wage



Gahanna. Heidi received her Bachelor of Science degree, with dual majors in Human Resources and Business Administration, from Franklin University. Heidi is a member of the Society for Human Resource Management (SHRM) and the Ohio Public Employer Labor Relations Association (OHPELRA).



**Michael Zhelesnik** joined Clemans Nelson in 2017 and is a Senior Consultant working out of the Akron office. Michael assists clients on various employment and human resource management issues, labor relations, and compensation plans. Michael received both his Juris Doctorate and LLM from Ohio Northern University, Pettit College of Law, and his B.A. from University of Cincinnati, where he majored in Political Science.

and hour, ADA, FMLA, HIPAA, and COBRA cases, among others. Kevin has experience litigating before various state courts in Ohio and the Federal Northern District Court of Ohio. Kevin now advises clients in human resource management, compensation plans, labor relations, contract negotiations, regulatory compliance, discipline, and policy development. Kevin obtained his Juris Doctor, cum laude, in 2005 from Case Western Reserve University School of Law. He has a Bachelor's Degree in Business Administration from the University of Wisconsin-Madison.

*Additional staff bios can be found on the 'Meet Our Staff' page at [www.clemansnelson.com](http://www.clemansnelson.com).*

*Clemans Nelson is an Equal Opportunity Employer.*

*All work will be performed by Clemans Nelson employees and will not be subcontracted out.*

## REFERENCES

<b>Projects completed during 2018</b>		
<b>Client</b>	<b>Project</b>	<b>Approximate Cost</b>
Stephanie Albanese Human Resources Director City of Pickerington 614.837.3974 x 2422	Compensation Plan	\$16,000
Shawn Hufstedler, CPA Chief of Staff and Director of Operations Mid-Ohio Regional Planning Commission P: 614.233.4136	Compensation Plan	\$18,000
Betty Dye VP/Director of Human Resources Columbus Metropolitan Housing Authority P: 614.421.6238	Compensation Plan	\$20,000

<b>Projects completed during 2017</b>		
<b>Client</b>	<b>Project</b>	<b>Approximate Cost</b>
Tracy Hatmaker Township Administrator Prairie Township P: 614.878.3317 x114	Compensation Plan	\$12,500
Judith C. Boyko Township Administrator West Chester Township P: 513.759.7210	Class and Compensation Plan and Benefit Study	\$40,000
Greg Preece Assistant City Manager City of Fairfield P: 513.867.5300	Class and Compensation Plan	\$27,500



<b>Projects completed during 2017</b>		
<b>Client</b>	<b>Project</b>	<b>Approximate Cost</b>
Melissa Messina-Lanthorn, Esq. Chief of Staff Franklin Co. Recorder P: 614.525.4129	Class and Compensation Plan	\$12,000
Brandon Huddleson County Administrator Greene Co. Board of Commissioners P: 937.562.5002	Class and Compensation Plan	\$23,500

<b>Projects completed during 2016</b>		
<b>Client</b>	<b>Project</b>	<b>Approximate Cost</b>
Robert Young Director of Human Resources Franklin County Board of Commissioners P: 614.525.3322	Class and Compensation Plan	\$27,500
Christine Emch, Esq. Director of Human Resources and Training Franklin County Clerk of Courts P: 614.525.2722	Class and Compensation Plan	\$25,000